

CLEARY GOTTLIEB STEEN & HAMILTON LLP

One Liberty Plaza
 New York, NY 10006-1470
 T: +1 212 225 2000
 F: +1 212 225 3999
 clearygottlieb.com

WASHINGTON, D.C. • PARIS • BRUSSELS • LONDON • MOSCOW
 FRANKFURT • COLOGNE • ROME • MILAN • HONG KONG • BEIJING
 BUENOS AIRES • SÃO PAULO • ABU DHABI • SEOUL • SILICON VALLEY

CRAIG B. BROD	MATTHEW P. SALERNO	ELANA S. BRONSON
NICOLAS CRABAR	MICHAEL J. ALBANO	MANUEL SILVA
RICHARD J. COOPER	VICTOR L. HOI	KYLE A. HARRIS
JEFFREY S. LEWIS	ROGER A. COOPER	LINA BENSMAN
PAUL J. SHIM	LILLIAN TSU	RON M. ZUCKERMAN
STEVEN L. WILNER	AMY R. SHAPIRO	KENNETH S. BLAZEJEWSKI
DAVID C. LOPEZ	JENNIFER KENNEDY PARK	MARK E. MCDONALD
MICHAEL A. GERSTENZANG	ELIZABETH LENAS	F. JAMAL FULTON
LEV L. DASSIN	LUKE A. BAREFOOT	PAUL V. IMPERATORE
JORGE U. JUANTORENA	JONATHAN S. KOLODNER	CLAYTON SIMMONS
MICHAEL D. WEINBERGER	DANIEL ILAN	CHARLES W. ALLEN
DAVID LEINWAND	MEYER H. FEDIDA	RESIDENT PARTNERS
DIANA L. WOLLMAN	ADRIAN R. LEIPSIC	JUDITH KASSEL
JEFFREY A. ROSENTHAL	ELIZABETH VICENS	PENELOPE L. CHRISTOPHOROU
MICHAEL D. DAYAN	ADAM J. BRENNEMAN	BOAZ S. MORAG
CARMINE D. BOCCUZZI, JR.	ARI D. MACKINNON	MARIA S. ALCONA
JEFFREY D. KARP	JAMES E. LANGSTON	HILDE G. BENFRITZ
KIMBERLY BROWN BLACKLOW	JARED GERBER	ANDREW W. EVER
FRANCISCO L. ESTERO	ROBERT H. STERN	HELENA K. GRANNIS
FRANCESCO L. ODELL	JANE VALALARE	JOHN V. HARRISON
WILLIAM L. MCRAE	DAVID H. HERRINGTON	LAURA BAGARELLA
JASON FACTOR	KIMBERLY R. SPOERRI	JONATHAN D.W. GIFFORD
JOON H. KIM	AARON J. MEYERS	SUSANNA E. PARKER
MARGARET S. PEPPERIS	DANIEL C. REYNOLDS	DAVID W.S. YUDIN
LISA M. SCHWEITZER	AUDRY X. CASUSOL	KARA A. HAILEY
JUAN G. GIRALDEZ	JOHN A. KUPIEC	ANNA KOGAN
DUANE McLAUGHLIN	ABENA A. MAINOO	BRANDON M. HAMMER
CHANTAL E. KORDULA	HUGH C. CONROY, JR.	RESIDENT COUNSEL
BENET J. O'REILLY	JOSEPH LANZKRON	
ADAM E. FLEISHER	MAURICE R. GINDI	
SEAN A. O'NEAL	KATHERINE R. REAVES	
GLENN P. MCGRORY	RAHUL MUKHI	

D: +1 212-225-2086
 jrosenthal@cgsh.com

March 21, 2022

VIA ECF

The Honorable Ona T. Wang
 United States Magistrate Judge
 United States District Court for the Southern District of New York
 Daniel Patrick Moynihan Courthouse
 500 Pearl Street
 New York, NY 10007

Re: *In re Application of Vale S.A. et al.*, No. 20-mc-199-JGK-OTW

Dear Judge Wang:

We write on behalf of Vale S.A., Vale Holdings B.V., and Vale International S.A. (collectively, “Vale”). While we disagree with much of the letter filed yesterday by Perfectus Real Estate Corp. and Tarpley Belnord Corp. (collectively, “Perfectus”), see ECF No. 140, such as the bizarre contention that Perfectus produced privileged documents to us, we do not wish to burden the Court with a response other than to correct Mr. Hellerstein’s misperception that Vale contends that the courtesy copy of Vale’s subpoena (the “Subpoena”) in connection with the action captioned Vale S.A. v. BSG Resources Limited, No. 19-cv-3619 (VSB) (RWL) that was emailed to Mr. Hellerstein constituted service. To the contrary, in addition to this courtesy copy, Vale S.A. properly served Perfectus with the Subpoena pursuant to Federal Rules of Civil Procedure 26, 45 and 69. See Exhibit A, Aff. of Deborah LaPointe, Mar. 11, 2022.

Accordingly, having been validly served, Perfectus is in default of its production obligations. While this will be a matter for Judge Lehrburger’s attention, all Vale seeks from this Court is permission to preserve the documents subject to the Subpoena so they are not irretrievably destroyed. This need is particularly acute given that Mr. Hellerstein’s letter

The Honorable Ona T. Wang, p. 2

nowhere contends that Perfectus has retained a copy of these documents following the resignation of its document custodian or pledges to do so if they are returned to it.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Jeffrey A. Rosenthal

Jeffrey A. Rosenthal
jrosenthal@cgsh.com
Lisa Vicens
evicens@cgsh.com
CLEARY GOTTLIEB STEEN & HAMILTON LLP
One Liberty Plaza
New York, New York 10006
T: 212-225-2000
F: 212-225-3999

Counsel for Vale S.A., Vale Holdings B.V., and Vale International S.A.

cc: All counsel of record